

# Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal

---

Volume 2 | Number 2

Article 13

---

1-1-2013

## Transformative Education: Using Ignatian Pedagogy to Teach Business Ethics

Joan Hise, Van

*Professor of Accounting, Fairfield University, [jlee@fairfield.edu](mailto:jlee@fairfield.edu)*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe>

---

### Recommended Citation

Hise, Van, Joan (2013) "Transformative Education: Using Ignatian Pedagogy to Teach Business Ethics," *Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal*: Vol. 2 : No. 2 , Article 13.

Available at: <https://epublications.regis.edu/jhe/vol2/iss2/13>

This Praxis is brought to you for free and open access by ePublications at Regis University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Jesuit Higher Education: A Journal by an authorized administrator of ePublications at Regis University. For more information, please contact [epublications@regis.edu](mailto:epublications@regis.edu).

## **Transformative Education: Using Ignatian Pedagogy to Teach Business Ethics**

Joan Van Hise  
Professor of Accounting  
Fairfield University  
([jvanhise@fairfield.edu](mailto:jvanhise@fairfield.edu))

### **Abstract**

Many have suggested that a Jesuit education can be transformative. This result is not surprising, as the conventional elements of Transformational Learning (TL) all can be found in the Ignatian Pedagogical Paradigm (IPP). This paper reports a case study of applying the IPP to the teaching of Business Ethics. Included are a review of the similarities between TL and the IPP, and a description of the application of the IPP to the specific class in Business Ethics. Finally the transformational changes that occur with the use of the IPP are addressed.

### **Introduction and Background**

Many U.S. Jesuit schools have claimed that the education they offer is transformative. Indeed, the strategic plans of several such schools make this claim formally. Canisius' 2011 strategic plan is entitled A Transformational Education: The Strategic Plan for Canisius College.<sup>1</sup> Similarly, Loyola Chicago has published a PDF booklet, "Transformative Education in the Jesuit Tradition" in which it states, "[I]gnatian pedagogy aims at assisting learners to undergo a series of internal transformations in how they go about understanding themselves vis-à-vis their own inclinations, passions, biases, and spontaneous reactions."<sup>2</sup> Even the Student Life division of St. Joseph's University offers what it describes as "Transformative Learning Goals."<sup>3</sup> As the quote from Loyola Chicago's plan makes clear, the hoped for transformation from exposure to such education is expected to take place in the student – not the teacher. However, Ignatian pedagogy has the ability to transform both the learner *and* the guide who accompanies the learner on the journey of knowing. In this, Ignatian pedagogy differs from other approaches to transformative education. The following sections include a brief review of the literature on

transformative education and the Ignatian Pedagogical Paradigm (IPP), followed by a concrete example of the application of Ignatian pedagogy in teaching Business Ethics to undergraduate students. The final sections include reflection on how the use of the IPP has been transformative in this business ethics class, and some lessons learned from the experience.

### **Literature Review**

Jack Mezirow is generally cited as the founder of the transformative education movement. His 1978 article, "Perspective transformation," first introduced "transformative learning"(TL) for the adult learner population.<sup>4</sup> Mezirow describes TL as "changing a frame of reference."<sup>5</sup> Since adult learners bring a series of life experiences to any learning encounter, the frames of reference that color their learning are already set in place. Mezirow suggests that transformation takes place when the learning becomes "the process of using a prior interpretation to construct a new or revised interpretation of the meaning of one's experience in order to guide future action."<sup>6</sup> As a result of TL, our frames of reference are made more "inclusive, discriminating, open, emotionally capable of change, and

reflective.”<sup>7</sup> This form of learning is distinct from traditional instructive approaches to learning in that TL involves a revision of the tacit assumptions that allow us to give meaning to our experiences, and by which we “look, judge and act.”<sup>8</sup>

As part of this educational experience, a change must occur in the relationship between teacher and learner; the teacher should have a goal for the learner that is larger than simply learning the material at hand. TL requires a different delivery approach to education as well. Mezirow suggests, “[E]ducators must help learners become aware and critical of their own and others' assumptions.”<sup>9</sup> Thus, reflection is a critical element, as is the context of the learner's experiences. Typically, TL also incorporates active learning techniques. In Mezirow's words, TL is “learner-centered, participatory, and interactive;” he suggests the use of role-playing, case studies and simulations.<sup>10</sup>

For Mezirow, critical reflection, which is a precondition to TL, occurs as an outgrowth of an educational process that fosters conscious, rational decisions. Grabov expands upon Mezirow's rational approach to TL. She suggests that Mezirow overstates the importance of rational thought in transformative education, and that TL should be part of an “intuitive, creative, emotional process.”<sup>11</sup> In this, Grabov draws heavily from the works of Boyd and Meyers.<sup>12</sup> Boyd and Meyers focus on discernment as the critical element that leads to TL. In their model of education, discernment guides the learner through the “realm of interior experience, one constituent being the rational expressed through insights, judgments, and decision; the other being the extrarational (sic) expressed through symbols, images, and feelings.”<sup>13</sup> In light of this, Grabov believes that incorporating both aspects in TL – the rational and the emotional – is preferable, and that the inclusion of both results in an improved approach to TL.

Grabov's merging of the rational and the emotional elements in education is not unique. In fact, disciples of the Ignatian

Pedagogical Paradigm (IPP) have been merging these two elements in education for more than 400 years. The IPP, as laid out in the *Ratio Studiorum*, is informed by the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius Loyola from which the educational model is drawn. As such, it brings together the rational and the emotional – in Ignatian language, the affect and intellect – in order to foster growth; transformational growth.

Many of the elements that are part of TL, indeed are part of the IPP. As noted earlier, Mezirow's work suggests that the role of the teacher must change in order for TL to occur. In Ignatian terms, “the teacher is not merely to inform, but to help the student progress in the truth.”<sup>14</sup> Teachers who follow this model speak of “accompanying” the learner; much as the director accompanies the retreatant in the Spiritual Exercises.

The formal model of the IPP includes five elements: context, experience, reflection, action and evaluation. Each of these corresponds to some aspect of TL as outlined above. Context, in Ignatian terms, includes knowing the personal circumstances of the students' lives; colloquially, “meeting them where they are.” Context “requires that the teacher become as conversant as possible with the life experience of the learner.”<sup>15</sup> In addition, context requires awareness of the historical and/or situational setting in which the learning is to take place. For TL proponents, context corresponds to the recognition that learners bring their life experiences with them; Mezirow's frames of reference.

The IPP notes that experience must take learners beyond rote knowledge to a more complex level of knowing. This is done by engaging the learner in active learning activities. As noted in an appendix to the *Ratio*, “We use the term experience to describe any activity in which, in addition to a cognitive grasp of the matter being considered, some sensation of an affective nature is registered by the student...”<sup>16</sup> In practice, this is often accomplished by taking students out of their comfort zones. Under these circumstances, students are encouraged to integrate all their

ways of knowing. In its emphasis on experiential learning then, the IPP affirms the affective nature of learning as an essential element of TL. This is consistent with the Mezirow's suggestion that active learning is the delivery method of choice for TL. Also, it is consistent with Grabov's depiction of TL; both rational and emotional, (intellectual and affective), ways of knowing are required for TL to take place.

The next element of the IPP, reflection, is also present in TL. In both educational approaches, reflection is the key element that merges head and heart. Mezirow recognized reflection as a critical element of TL; without it, transformation would not take place. Reflection is the key element of the IPP as well. Ignatian reflection both creates a space for critical engagement of experience, and thus, allows the learner to personally appropriate new concepts. Reflection can free learners from prejudices and biases and lead to a change in heart, or in Mezirow's terms, a change in the frame of reference. Both models posit that such changes in knowing ideally can lead also to changes in doing. Doing becomes the next element of the IPP – action.

Action involves two steps: interiorizing and externally manifesting choices. This corresponds closely to Boyd & Meyers description of the learning process. Moreover, Boyd & Meyers note the role discernment plays in guiding the learner in reflection on choices. Discernment is a clearly Ignatian concept; one drawn directly from the Spiritual Exercises. In discernment, the decision maker follows a prescribed sequential approach, informed by the Spirit, to choose between two goods. One does not learn discernment by reading about it, but rather through practice; a clearly experiential approach to TL.

Finally, the last element of the IPP is evaluation. In evaluation, the teacher assesses the students' growth in both intellect and affect. The question is not only whether the student has learned the material, but also whether the student has matured, shown moral growth. In other words, has the learner been transformed?

In light of the many common elements of TL and the IPP, the claims noted earlier by Jesuit universities that they produce transformational education gain credence. Moreover, as a result of the similarities between TL and the IPP, the application of the IPP would seem appropriate in a course in which transformational learning is a desired outcome. Business Ethics is such a course. Consequently, the rest of this paper reports a case study in applying the IPP to a specific Business Ethics course, and the lessons learned from that experience in terms of the transformations that took place.

### **Applying the IPP to a Business Ethics Class**

The business ethics class in question is a unique section of the course that is offered to students in a sophomore residential college. This residential college has an Ignatian theme; students spend the year addressing three overarching questions: Who am I? Whose am I? Who am I called to be? The class size is limited to thirty-two students. While most of the students are residents of the sophomore residential college, there are always a handful of juniors and seniors in the class.

Context, the first characteristic of the IPP, sets the stage for TL. Since most of the students are members of a residential college, many already know each other, which helps to foster a sense of community. The upperclassmen in the class who are not a part of this residential college, have reported, anecdotally, with surprise, how welcomed they have felt into this learning community. Certain class rules help to enforce the community aspect of the learning endeavor. All students are required to use each other's names when they agree or disagree with each other in class discussions. In addition, as noted in the syllabus, (the syllabus is included in Appendix A), all classroom conversations are treated as confidential. No one is permitted to speak about another's comments outside of class except with the individual in question. This rule has freed students to voice their opinions honestly in the classroom.

The students complete a biographical essay in the first week of the semester, which helps the

instructor find out where they are in their lives. In writing this essay, the students respond to a series of prompts in the syllabus. While the prompts guide the students to vocational considerations, virtually all the students start their essays by telling about themselves. They describe parents, siblings, religious upbringing, schools they attended, sports they played, and then, who they hope to become. When the essays are returned to the class, the instructor shares her own “biography” – who she is and how she came to be teaching this class. This simple action has a profound effect on the students. Many report that they never have heard a professor share his/her life story with the class. Moreover, this modeling of openness encourages the students to be more open in their own interactions in class by. Finally, this sharing helps the students begin to see that rather than leading them, the instructor is journeying with them, on this voyage of discovery.

Context can have a darker side as well; sometimes the places where we need to meet our students are not places we would have otherwise chosen to go. An example will illustrate the need for flexibility in meeting the students where they are. Our school newspaper used to have a column that featured the opinions of a male and female student each week. One week’s column was entitled “The walk of shame.” Many students on campus took offense at the male columnist’s comments this particular week, in which he described his conquest of women in the most vulgar terms.

The controversy spilled over into class when one of the most talkative students was unusually quiet in class one morning – the morning the column was printed. After class, the student confided that she herself had been a victim of a sexual assault, and the male reporter’s column really upset her. When offered the opportunity to discuss the column in the next class meeting, the student readily agreed. So, all the students received a message asking them to read the column in question and come to class prepared to discuss it. To everyone’s surprise, the roommate of the male columnist was also in the class, which engendered a very lively discussion. The

students had a chance to air their views, and also to discuss ethical issues about the messages businesses send with their choice of advertisements. In the end, a number of students worked on a petition to ask the University to sanction the newspaper. The paper ultimately was not sanctioned, but the column was eliminated from the paper. While this session clearly represented a deviation from the plans laid out on the syllabus, real learning and growth had taken place.

The next element of the IPP, experience, is the foundation for decisions about delivery of the course content. Lecture is used only rarely in this Business Ethics class. Inspired by the IPP, the role of the instructor has shifted from that of the “sage on the stage” to the “guide on the side.” The course is largely student-driven; students select the topics for the debates, choose from among a number of optional topics to be added to the syllabus, and suggest guest speakers. The class itself is mostly discussion-based. The instructor facilitates the discussions with active learning experiences including case studies, debates and group activities.

Two peculiarly Ignatian decision-making approaches are introduced in the class: discernment, an explicitly spiritual method derived from the Spiritual Exercises, and Lonergan’s “questing.” Students are encouraged to practice these techniques in making ethical decisions. Another class rule is relevant here: when discussing any ethical dilemmas, the students are required to come up with at least three solutions. This is consistent both with discernment and questing in that both approaches seek to force out all possible solutions. This is challenging for many of the students who have become accustomed to seeing things in terms of black and white; right and wrong. Many times, the third and fourth solutions to a problem are somewhat messy or involve uncertainty – which is exactly the point! Just as it takes practice to develop a discerning heart, it takes practice to develop comfort in the unknown.

As noted above, TL and the IPP agree on the critical importance of reflection in producing

change. The significance of reflection in this class cannot be overstated. Students are required to write a reflection after each class. In addition, they are required to include a reflection in the semester term paper. The daily reflections are prompted by a series of questions in the syllabus designed to get the students to write about what they were feeling after class. The reflections are posted online in a classroom management application within 48 hours of the end of class. Each reflection is marked as private; it is visible only by the instructor and the student who posted it.

The reflections range from perfunctory to profound, from superficial to deeply personal. The instructor responds to each one, encouraging, challenging, and sometimes entering into dialogue with the writer. Reflection is not easy for some of the students. These students may start out by summarizing the class discussion, and need some gentle prodding to move beyond mere summarization. As the semester progresses, the growth in most students is easily recognizable. For some the growth is gradual; for others, there is a particular “Aha” moment. With the current “Facebook generation” of learners for whom the lines between public and private are often blurred, the reflections may become a safe space to “vent.” In the reflections, students have described past bullying or sexual harassment, sexual attacks, the loss of a loved one, or trouble with their parents. Multiple students have “come out” for the first time in their reflections. When appropriate, students have been referred to seek professional counseling on the basis of their reflections.

Although the individual reflections are private, the instructor shares a sense of the reflections at the start of the following class. The students eagerly anticipate this “report.” Following the discussion of a particularly controversial topic in class on which many of the students reflected, the report back might include information on what percent of those who reflected on the issue favored each position. Sometimes the instructor asks a student for permission to read a particular passage or quote he/she included in his/her reflection as part of the report on the reflections. Sharing a

summary of the reflections in this anonymous manner reinforces the sense of community in the classroom; the students don’t learn by themselves, but in community with their classmates. In addition, it serves as a bridge from topic to topic in the course.

The reflections are also the lynchpin to the remaining two aspects of the IPP: action and evaluation. The goal of TL is to bring about change in the learner. The goal of the IPP is bring about change in the learner such that he/she is moved to action – ideally in the service of others. Reflection is the means through which this change is brought to the surface. Sometimes the change occurs within the course of the semester and leads to an immediate resultant action, as in the semester when one student changed her major from Finance, to Management with a Peace and Justice minor. Other students have become involved in campus fair trade issues or socially responsible investing groups. More often, the action occurs later in life. One graduate opted for a service year after graduation; others have taken jobs with socially responsible companies.

In light of the lag time between experience, reflection and action, evaluation can be difficult. However, the students’ short-term growth can be assessed to a degree through their writings. As the semester progresses, the students increasingly draw connections, in their reflections, between the course readings/discussions and their other classes, things that are happening in the “real world” and events in their own lives. In doing so, they demonstrate personal growth: increased ethical perception and skill in approaching ethical decisions, and a more integrated approach to life.

Often, the student will even recognize how much he/she has grown. During one semester, one student often took a position at odds with the rest of the class. He doggedly defended his views, much to the consternation of his classmates. Early in the semester, his classmates’ reflections frequently said things like, “I was so annoyed at him” or “I can’t believe he thinks that.” But, near the end of the semester, one student wrote, “I can’t

believe I'm writing this, but I agree with him. If the rest of the class would just listen to him, they would understand why he's right about this." Growth.

### **Transformation**

#### **Of the Students**

As discussed earlier, the goal of TL is to bring about a change in the student's "frame of reference." Similarly, the IPP seeks to generate change in the learner. Specifically, Ignatian pedagogy seeks to form "men and women of competence, conscience and compassionate commitment."<sup>17</sup> There is no concrete proof of such change in the students as a result of having experienced this particular Business Ethics course, nor could any positive change noted be attributed only to this class since the students did not take this course in isolation, but in tandem with their other business and liberal arts courses. Anecdotal, however, there is growth in the students. Many have written in their final reflections that they have started to see the world as more than black and white, that they have recognized perspectives beyond their own. Among the most insightful comments about the class, are those from several students who have written that they first thought Business Ethics was about WHAT to think, but now they know it is about HOW to think.

Many students report that if they could take away only one thing from the class, it would be a phrase that has become something of a mantra for the class: "Own your biases." The inspiration for this phrase is the Spiritual Exercises, in which self-awareness, and especially of God's love for us as sinners, is the first form of knowledge one develops. Each student is uniquely the product of his/her life experiences. Those experiences will naturally color one's views of the world. Only by recognizing our built-in bias, can we reach a level of Ignatian detachment and make a truly free decision.

#### **Of the instructor**

Perhaps the most unexpected outcomes of the class are not the changes observed in the students, but the changes in the instructor.

When I started teaching this course, I already had many years teaching experience. As a new professor, I first had employed mostly lecture in the classroom, but quickly moved on to more innovative pedagogies. However, I knew nothing of the IPP until the founding of the particular residential college through which the Business Ethics course is offered. The university offered a number of workshops at that time to familiarize faculty with the IPP; I took advantage of all of them.

At first, I simply dipped a toe into the pool of the IPP. I had always been very cognizant of where my students were in their lives; but now this had a name – context – a part of the IPP with which I was becoming familiar. After the first year of the class, I added the biographical essay to gather information on the context of the students' lives more systematically; the depth of personal information they revealed in this short assignment astonished me. In response, I decided to share more of my history with the class than I had in the past. As noted earlier, this had an unexpected and dramatic effect on the students.

My transition from the "sage on the stage" to the "guide on the side" was a gradual one. It was easy to adapt active learning techniques I used in other classes to the Business Ethics class, so I integrated case studies and debates. As my role in the classroom changed, my absolute control over the syllabus started slipping. At first, I used commercially available cases and dictated the debate topics for each term. Before long, in response to student feedback, I was writing my own cases on topics in which the students expressed interest, and allowing the students to choose the debate topics.


From the start, the course had included a number of guest speakers. However, as I let the students suggest debate topics, I soon encouraged them to suggest guest speakers as well. The word "tentative" crept onto the syllabus that was handed out on the first day of class. I couldn't expect my students to develop comfort in the unknown if I wasn't willing to accept a bit of uncertainty in my role.

As I became more attuned to the context of the students' lives, I recognized that there were, at times, more important lessons to be learned than what I had planned on covering on any given day – lessons about moving on after death or sexual assault, or finding the courage to stand up for change. I no longer evaluated my teaching success by the number of chapters/topics covered, but rather by how well I responded to the needs of my students. Among those needs was a need to be educated, so I always made sure we got through the basics, but even those “basics” were often presented in different ways each term in response to the students in the class that year.

My knowledge of Ignatian pedagogy took a giant leap forward when I completed a 19<sup>th</sup> Annotation Retreat of the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius, from which the pedagogical model is derived. Perhaps one of the most important insights I gained from that experience was the critical role of reflection – so I added extensive reflection to the class. That simple action further transformed the relationship between teacher and learner. I had to learn to fill this new role. Recognizing the importance of “finding God in all things,” I tried to find something positive, something affirming, to say to each student in response to his/her reflection, but I was completely unprepared for the raw emotion included in these reflections. Reading the daily reflections has become the most satisfying – and the most emotionally exhausting – part of teaching this class.

### Lessons Learned

The IPP is a time-tested approach to bringing about transformation – in the learners, and the instructor. Transformative learning through the IPP is not for the faint of heart; it can take you places you never expected to go. But it can also make each time you teach a course a completely new experience because the course is formed around the individual students in the class. Incorporating aspects of the IPP into existing classes is relatively easy to do, but engaging with the students in the way demanded by the IPP is time consuming,

emotionally demanding, and intensely satisfying – an experience not to be missed! 

### Notes

<sup>1</sup> Canisius College, “Strategic Planning,” accessed May 14, 2012, [http://www.canisius.edu/planning/strategic\\_plan.pdf](http://www.canisius.edu/planning/strategic_plan.pdf).

<sup>2</sup> Daniel F. Hartnett, S.J., *Transformative Education in the Jesuit Tradition* (Chicago: Loyola University Chicago, 2009), 8, [http://www.luhs.org/depts/ministry/trans\\_ed.pdf](http://www.luhs.org/depts/ministry/trans_ed.pdf).

<sup>3</sup> St. Joseph's University, “Student Life,” accessed May 14, 2012, <http://www.sju.edu/studentlife/dlg/>.

<sup>4</sup> Jack Mezirow, “Perspective Transformation,” *Adult Education* 28 (1978): 100-110.

<sup>5</sup> Jack Mezirow, “Transformative Learning: Theory to Practice,” in *Transformative Learning in Action: Insights in Practice. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, P. Cranton ed., (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 74, 1997) 5-12.

<sup>6</sup> Jack Mezirow, “Contemporary Paradigms of Learning,” *Adult Education Quarterly* 46, no. 3 (1996): 162.

<sup>7</sup> Jack Mezirow and Associates, *Learning as Transformation: Critical Perspectives on a Theory in Progress* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000), 8.

<sup>8</sup> Pope John XXIII, *Mater et Magistra* (Vatican City: Typis Polyglottis Vaticanis, 1961), sec. 4, ¶ 236.

<sup>9</sup> Mezirow, “Transformative Learning,” (1997): 5-12.

<sup>10</sup> Mezirow, “Transformative Learning,” (1997): 5-12.

<sup>11</sup> Valeria Grabov, “The Many Facets of Transformative Learning Theory and Practice,” in *Transformative Learning in Action: Insights in Practice. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, ed. P. Cranton (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 74, 1997) 90.

<sup>12</sup> Robert D. Boyd and J. Gordon Myers, “Transformative Education,” *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 7, no. 4 (October-December 1988): 261-284.

<sup>13</sup> Boyd and Myers, “Transformative Education,” 275.

<sup>14</sup> Jesuit Secondary Education Association (JSEA), quoting Charnot, S.J., *Ignatian Pedagogy A Practical Approach*, 1993, 9. Originally published as a monograph; reprinted as Appendix B in *The Jesuit Ratio Studiorum of 1599: 400<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Perspectives*.

<sup>15</sup> JSEA, 1993, 35.

<sup>16</sup> Ibid.



<sup>17</sup> Ibid., 241.

### Bibliography

- Boyd, Robert D. and J. Gordon Myers. "Transformative Education," *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 7, no. 4 (October-December 1988): 261-283.
- Canisius College. "Strategic Planning." Accessed May 14, 2012. [http://www.canisius.edu/planning/strategic\\_plan.pdf](http://www.canisius.edu/planning/strategic_plan.pdf).
- Grabov, Valeria. "The Many Facets of Transformative Learning Theory and Practice," in *Transformative Learning in Action: Insights in Practice. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, edited by P. Cranton, 89-96. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 1997.
- Hartnett, Daniel F., S.J. *Transformative Education in the Jesuit Tradition*. Chicago: Loyola University Chicago, 2009. Accessed May 14, 2012. [http://www.luhs.org/depts/ministry/trans\\_ed.pdf](http://www.luhs.org/depts/ministry/trans_ed.pdf).
- Jesuit Secondary Education Association (JSEA). *Ignatian Pedagogy A Practical Approach*, 1993. Originally published as a monograph; reprinted as Appendix B in *The Jesuit Ratio Studiorum of 1599: 400<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Perspectives*. Bronx, NY: Fordham University Press, 2000.
- Mezirow, Jack. "Perspective Transformation." *Adult Education* 28 (1978): 100-110.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Transformative Learning: Theory to Practice." In *Transformative Learning in Action: Insights in Practice. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, edited by P. Cranton, 5-12. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Contemporary Paradigms of Learning," *Adult Education Quarterly* 46, no. 3 (1996): 158-72.
- Mezirow, Jack and Associates. *Learning as Transformation: Critical Perspectives on a Theory in Progress*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000.
- Pope John XXIII, Mater et Magistra. Vatican City: Typis Polyglottis Vaticanis, 1961.
- St. Joseph's University. "Student Life." Accessed May 14, 2012. <http://www.sju.edu/studentlife/tlg/>.

## Appendix A

### Sample Syllabus for Business Ethics

#### Objectives:

1) *Enhance each student's ethical perception.*

This course seeks to prepare you for ethical issues you will encounter in your careers. To help you understand and manage these problems, you must first develop your capacity to “see” ethics issues in business.

2) *Enhance each student's awareness of societal injustices.*

We will highlight the history of past injustices that have allowed unjust situations to develop and persist when we address discrimination on the basis of race, gender or disability, affirmative action, the rights of workers, sweatshops, outsourcing, and environmental ethics. We will also engage as a class in discussion of alternative solutions to these injustices.

3) *Improve each student's ethical decision making and communication skills.*

Ethical problems are often ambiguous and complex. Imaginative and thoughtful ethical “vision” alone is not sufficient to address them; you also have to convert your insights into action. Accordingly, this course will help you first analyze and evaluate ideas, and then express your conclusions in both oral and written form so that you can promote effective and responsible business strategies.

4) *Introduce each student to the decision making models associated with Ignatian discernment and the work of Bernard Lonergan S.J.*

These approaches will help you reach a clearer understanding of your personal values. You will be encouraged to apply these techniques not only to classroom ethical dilemmas, but to life and vocational decisions as well.

- Texts:**
1. *Business Ethics.* Richardson, ed.
  2. Supplemental readings and other course information are posted to the library's electronic reserves

**Classroom Policies:** It is important that you attend class and actively participate in classroom discussions. In order to do this, you must complete and think about readings in advance of the class period in which those readings are discussed. **10% of your grade is based on the extent to which you are an active participant in the in-class learning experience.**

This course will require us to publicly present our reasons for our positions on important ethical issues. Every student will respect the right of others in class to freely express their views on any issue. Each person should be prepared to give reasons for his/her views, if asked for them. **In order to foster more open discussion on a variety of sometimes controversial topics, all classroom discussions will be considered confidential. No one is permitted to discuss another's views outside of the classroom except with that individual.**

**Grading:**

Reflections	22%
Biographical essay	2
Debate presentation	10
Critical essay (1 @ 10; 2 @ 13 points each)	36
Ethics interview final paper	20
Class participation	10

**Reflections:** Each student should reflect on what he/she has learned in class. The fruits of this reflection should be reported on a brief, (approximately 1 page) reflective paper, and uploaded **no later than 48 hours after the class**. This reflection should consider questions such as the following:

- What aspects of the class most deeply affected me? Why?
- What aspects of the class are most relevant to me and to my life? Why?
- If there wasn't anything in class that touched me or seemed relevant, why wasn't there?
- Did I gain any new insights in class?
- What new issues do I want to consider as a result of today's class?
- Did anything I experienced in class change the way I see myself? Others?

If your reflections on the class material led you to search the web for additional sources, please include a link to the additional materials you considered in your reflection.

I understand that students may not be able to post a reflection on each class meeting. However, I expect all students will post reflections on the vast majority of class meetings. I will inform each student if he/she is not posting a sufficient number of reflections, or if his/her reflections are not sufficiently well developed. I will not inform you if you are posting your reflections late as this should be obvious to you.

*Points: satisfactory reflections = 1; amazing reflections = 1.5-2; weak reflections = .5*

**Biographical essay:** In keeping with the themes of “who am I?”, “whose am I?” and “who am I called to be?” you are to write a biographical essay. In it you should introduce yourself. You should also outline your thoughts about your future career, and how such a career might relate to your calling. While you may not yet know what you want to do “when you grow up”, consider the following questions in the course of your essay:

- What do I want to do?
- What am I good at?
- Is there anyone who wants or needs me to do what I would like to do?
- What are my weaknesses?
- How will I achieve meaning through a career in business?
- Who will help me over the course of my career to achieve meaning?
- How much money do I want to make?
- How much money do I need to make to live the type of life to which I aspire?
- How will I contribute to the well being of my fellow man?
- Who do I want to be in 20 years?

**Panel Presentation/Class Debate:** Each team is required to present a fair and balanced argument to the class outlining the two sides of one of the debate topics listed below (or another relevant topic approved by the instructor). Sign-ups for topics will be accepted on a first-come, first-served basis.

1. All student teams should read background material on the question to be debated. The team should then decide which side of the issue it plans to support. Students will sit with their teams during the debate.
2. The team leading the debate will be expected to do more research than the other teams in the class. The team leading the debate will have approximately 10 minutes to present its case. Each side of the argument should be presented in a logical, well-reasoned manner.
3. After the team leading the debate has presented its case, the floor will be opened to the rest of the class. Each team is required to engage in the class debate.

**Possible topics:**

1. Gender Issues - Women in the workplace *are still/are no longer* disadvantaged by such issues as the glass ceiling, “mommy tracking”, pay disparities and sexual harassment.
2. Americans with Disabilities Act - The ADA *should/should not* be broadly construed to ensure fair treatment of all individuals with disabilities.
3. Whistle blowing - Whistle blowers *are/are not* currently adequately protected, and *do not need/need* additional protection under federal law.
4. Affirmative Action - Affirmative action *is/is not* an appropriate means of redressing past injustices.
5. International Outsourcing - Outsourcing of production to lower wage countries *is/is not* beneficial for all parties involved.
6. Socially responsible business practices - Socially responsible business practices should be used *only when/whether or not* they enhance profitability.
7. Free market policies - The government *should/should not* support selected businesses or industries with its policies.
8. Drug testing – Pharmaceutical companies *should/should not* test drugs on children.

Please feel free to suggest additional debate topics, especially those that address solutions to the societal injustices we will discuss in class.

*Debate grade:*

*Your grade on the debate presentation will be based on how thoroughly you cover the material (3 pts); how well you present the material (1 pt); how creatively you present the material (1 pt) and how well you engage the class (2 pts) = 7 pts max*

*1 point max for each debate for which you are not presenting = 3 pts max*

**Critical Essay:** The purpose of this essay assignment is to help you develop the capacity to write critically and persuasively about complex business issues. To promote focused criticism, I am providing a very explicit structure for you to follow, which is detailed below. Your essay will consist of a thesis paragraph, two supporting paragraphs, two rebuttal paragraphs and replies to the rebuttals. You must write your essays according to this structure. Your thesis statement can be centered on any issue from the relevant portion of the course about which you wish to argue. (You may want to submit your thesis for approval prior to writing the paper.) **At least one of your three essays must deal with an issue of social injustice in the US.**

#### Format of the Structured Argument

In what follows, bold text is language that you must use, *literally*, in your essay. *[Italicized text in brackets]* gives you directions for what to write; you supply the content. Follow these directions closely.

**My thesis is that** *[in one sentence state the critical claim you are making about a specific topic from one of the cases. Be sure to state your thesis in normative terms].* **To support my thesis, I offer two supporting reasons: First,** *[state your first supporting reason in one sentence].* **Second,** *[state your second supporting reason in one sentence].*

**My first supporting reason is** *[state the same sentence you gave in your thesis paragraph as your first supporting reason. Then, in one paragraph, give evidence for this supporting reason. Do not say anything that is not directly relevant to your supporting reason.]*

**It is important to acknowledge the objection that** *[state in one sentence an important exception or qualification to your first supporting reason. Then develop the objection in one paragraph.]*

**However, this objection to my first supporting reason is not decisive because** *[state a response to your objection, in several sentences at most, which show why your objection has not convinced you to abandon your overall argument.]*

**My second supporting reason is** *[do the same as for your first supporting reason].*

**It is important to acknowledge the objection that** *[state in one sentence an important exception or qualification to your second supporting reason. Then develop the objection in one paragraph.]*

**However, this objection to my second supporting reason is not decisive because** *[state a response to your objection, in several sentences at most, which show why your objection has not convinced you to abandon your overall argument.]*

Some Tips: It is not necessary to do extensive additional research for the content of your arguments. However, you are welcome to do so. If you do, be sure to cite your sources. Also, while you will undoubtedly use common sense to develop your arguments, you must also use the formal ethical theories introduced in the course. Please acknowledge when your reasoning in any particular paragraph reflects any of these perspectives or methods.

*Essay grade:*

- *Thesis (1/1 pt)*
- *1<sup>st</sup> argument (2/3 pts)*
- *2<sup>nd</sup> argument (2/3 pts)*
- *Use of ethical theory (2/3 pts)*
- *Follow form exactly (1/1 pt)*
- *Writing/grammar/citations (2/2 pts)*

**Ethics Interview Paper:**

Interview: You are to investigate an ethical issue in the workplace, combining your knowledge from class with original empirical research. Your general objective is to produce a description of an actual business ethics issue as well as an ethical assessment of that issue.

Your research will take the form of an interview. The interview subject should be someone who has had at least five years continuous, full-time work experience, though more is better. There are no other restrictions on the eligibility of your subject, but it should be someone with whom you can talk comfortably and candidly.

When you've identified an interview subject, you must obtain informed consent to participate. Tell him or her about the purpose of this interview, making clear that you will want him or her to describe an actual work experience that required a significant judgment call. Emphasize that the identity of the interview subject will remain anonymous and that you will relate his or her account in such a way that it will not be possible to identify personally any companies or individuals described.

You should plan to have at least one substantial conversation with your subject (an hour is not unusual) though you may find it helpful to have a number of shorter follow-up conversations as you proceed. It would be ideal to have a face-to-face conversation, although telephone interviews are permissible (especially for any follow-up conversations). I strongly advise against using a tape recorder. Instead, make brief written notes during the interview, expanding them on your own immediately after the interview.

To get started, you might use a very general opening question like, "I'm doing a paper on responsible business practice in the workplace. On a strictly anonymous basis, could you tell me about any experiences you have had in your career that you think were important from an ethical point of view?" You might alert your subject ahead of time to expect this kind of question, so that when your actual interview takes place he or she may already have a few ideas. Part of your interview must include having your subject explain what he or she means by "ethics." If the subject's concept of ethics is different than your own, you should be willing to let your subject to use "ethics" in the way that he or she is accustomed to using it.

Let the interview proceed naturally. Let your subject tell his or her story as he or she wants to. But listen closely and ask good follow-up questions. Ask for clarification or elaboration. Don't accept everything your subject says at face value; ask for pertinent background information, dig beneath the surface of the story for deeper themes or ideas. Ask your subject how he or she felt about the issue described.

Paper: You will produce a 4-6 page paper, including the following:

1. A brief introduction of the person you've identified, in general how you know this person, what kind of work this person does. *Be sure to include a description of how the subject defines ethics.* [Remember to preserve anonymity. You should use a fictitious name for the subject and his/her employer. *Also please indicate if*

*the subject gives permission for the case to be developed into an instructional case for use by future classes. Any identifying factors would be altered if the case is selected for development as an instructional case.] (2 pts)*

2. A descriptive account of the primary ethical issue related by the subject. Your subject may share a number of ethical issues. Use only the one you judge to be most important. Be detailed and vivid in your description. I want to feel like I was actually there, listening. (3 pts)

3. A critical evaluation of the ethical issue and the way it was handled by the subject. *You will need to incorporate ethical theory in evaluating the ethical issue. Be sure to include (and justify) your own position on the ethical issue.* You must also evaluate the decision making model used by the subject. (10 pts)

4. Your reflection on the project. Use the questions for reflective papers outlined above, substituting the word “project” for “class”. (2 pts)

5. An Appendix (this part does not count toward the suggested page length of your paper). Here you will describe the mechanics of the interview -- where it took place, how long it took, etc. You will also provide a summary of the interview, using your interview notes (this may include material that does not make its way into the formal paper). (1 pt)

(2 points will be allocated for writing/grammar)

It is not necessary to use additional research sources (books, articles, etc.), but if you do, be sure to give appropriate reference citations.

**Sample Class Schedule**

Topic	Reading	Guest lecturer	Case
Introduction			Ties that Bind
Consequential and Nonconsequential Thinking	“Thinking ethically: A framework for moral decision making” (text)		Corporate Cars
Consequential and Nonconsequential Thinking (cont’d)			Tylenol
Virtue ethics Who am I?	The Organization Man (reserves)		Malden Mills
Who are we? What is the purpose of Business?	<i>Bishops Pastoral</i> (reserves) <i>Poultry Pastoral</i> (reserves) Blog on Charles Handy (reserves)		Mission statements  Smokes R Us
Socially responsible businesses	“The emergence of a triple bottom line” (reserves)  “Emerging Lessons” (text) <u>OR</u> <a href="http://www.iveybusinessjournal.com/topics/global-business/from-subsistence-marketplaces-to-sustainable-marketplaces-a-bottom-up-perspective-on-the-role-of-business-in-poverty-alleviation">http://www.iveybusinessjournal.com/topics/global-business/from-subsistence-marketplaces-to-sustainable-marketplaces-a-bottom-up-perspective-on-the-role-of-business-in-poverty-alleviation</a>		Mondragon
Eminent Domain and Business Development	Kelo case post-script: <a href="http://www.nytimes.com/2009/11/13/nyregion/13pfizer.html">http://www.nytimes.com/2009/11/13/nyregion/13pfizer.html</a>  Lakewood, OH: <a href="http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2003/09/26/60minutes/main575343.shtml">http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2003/09/26/60minutes/main575343.shtml</a>		
Justice theories  Leaders/Vision An alternate business leadership model	Rawls (reserves)  Arrupe Speech 1973 Kolvenbach Speech 2000 Jesuit GC 34: Decree 3 <a href="http://onlineministries.creighton.edu/CollaborativeMinistry/justice.html">http://onlineministries.creighton.edu/CollaborativeMinistry/justice.html</a>  <i>Heroic Leadership</i> – Lowney <a href="http://www.chrislowney.com/heroic/heroic-leadership.htm#">http://www.chrislowney.com/heroic/heroic-leadership.htm#</a>  “Hiring character” (text) “Outside the box ethics” (text)		Home Depot
Socially responsible business		DEBATE	



Discrimination Disparate impact BFOQ	<a href="http://www.nytimes.com/1996/11/17/us/si ze-of-texaco-discrimination-settlement-could-encourage-more-lawsuits.html?pagewanted=all&amp;src=pm">http://www.nytimes.com/1996/11/17/us/si ze-of-texaco-discrimination-settlement-could-encourage-more-lawsuits.html?pagewanted=all&amp;src=pm</a>  <a href="http://www.nytimes.com/1994/05/25/us/de nny-s-restaurants-to-pay-54-million-in-race-bias-suits.html?pagewanted=all&amp;src=pm">http://www.nytimes.com/1994/05/25/us/de nny-s-restaurants-to-pay-54-million-in-race-bias-suits.html?pagewanted=all&amp;src=pm</a>  “Older workers running to the courthouse” (text) <a href="http://www.shrm.org/Publications/hrmagazi ne/EditorialContent/Pages/0608grossman.as px">http://www.shrm.org/Publications/hrmagazi ne/EditorialContent/Pages/0608grossman.as px</a>  “Keeping your senior staffers” (text) <a href="http://money.cnn.com/2009/07/10/news/c ompanies/basf_retaining_senior_engineers.fo rtune/index.htm">http://money.cnn.com/2009/07/10/news/c ompanies/basf_retaining_senior_engineers.fo rtune/index.htm</a>		Griggs vs. Duke Power Texaco Denny’s
Affirmative Action Gender Equity	“The business case for diversity” (text)  For office romance, the secret’s out” (text) <a href="http://online.wsj.com/article/SB1000142405 2748704182004575055191587179832.html">http://online.wsj.com/article/SB1000142405 2748704182004575055191587179832.html</a>  “Women and the labyrinth of leadership” (TX* - ERES)		New Haven FD
Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)	FAQ on the ADA: <a href="http://www.ada.gov/ada.html">http://www.ada.gov/ada.html</a>	Ffld. Staff w/ disability	
Free market policies		DEBATE	
SRI		Alum	Grameen
<u>Decision-making</u> Ignatian Discernment The Examen Lonergan	“Six steps for remedying contemporary ethical problems” reserves) Discernment (reserves) Personal Authenticity (reserves)		“The parable of the Sadhu” (text)
Whistleblowing	“Protecting the whistleblower” (text)		A fork and knife in the road Mom to jail?
Whistleblowing		DEBATE	
Product Liability	“Serving unfair customers” (text)		Pinto, Corvair, Crown Vic, AH Robbins, Dow Corning, Nestle, Beechnut
Marketing: - to the Bottom of the Pyramid - to Children	Integrative Justice Model (reserves)		McDonalds

Ignatian Seminar	Mandatory for all residential college students; recommended for others		
Downsizing/ Outsourcing Domestic & International	<p>“Reflecting on downsizing: what have managers learned?” (text)  <a href="http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_hb6698/is_2_73/ai_n28571764/?tag=content;col1">http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_hb6698/is_2_73/ai_n28571764/?tag=content;col1</a></p> <p>Sweatshops: Review EFJ website  <a href="http://www.educatingforjustice.org/stopnikesweatshops.htm">http://www.educatingforjustice.org/stopnikesweatshops.htm</a></p>		Nike If the Pants Fit
Sweatshops		DEBATE	
International Business Ethics	World Bank Development Indicators		Big Pharma
Ethics of College Sports	<p>“Financial considerations often trounce ethics in NCAA sports”  <a href="http://business-ethics.com/2011/08/30/7702-college-sports-financial-considerations-often-trounce-ethics-in-ncaa/">http://business-ethics.com/2011/08/30/7702-college-sports-financial-considerations-often-trounce-ethics-in-ncaa/</a></p> <p>“College athletes’ graduation rates 2011”  <a href="http://chronicle.com/article/College-Athletes-Graduation/129526/">http://chronicle.com/article/College-Athletes-Graduation/129526/</a></p> <p>“Athletic budgets continue to climb”  <a href="http://www.sportsbusinessdaily.com/Journal/Issues/2011/08/22/In-Depth/Budgets.aspx">http://www.sportsbusinessdaily.com/Journal/Issues/2011/08/22/In-Depth/Budgets.aspx</a></p>		Penn State Ohio State U of Miami
Ethics, work-life balance – an example from accounting		TBD	
Environmental Ethics			
Undocumented workers			
Work-life balance – the view from both sides	“Are you too family friendly?” (text)	Ptr. From small CPA firm who is adjunct faculty and alum who works for him	
Ownership of “private” information	“Employers are stung with a hefty price when employees suffer an identity theft” (text)		